

Notes on dimensional composition roofing.

Waterford CC&Rs delegate discretion to the Architectural Review Committee to decide on approval of essentially all types of roofing material except two: Composition shingles and rock. The prohibition against composition shingles is extremely strong and was written when the only type of composition shingles in general use were three-tab asphalt shingles. These have generally been considered to have an inferior appearance, often have a shorter lifetime than other materials, and are generally considered to be detrimental to property values. Architectural standards of bodies such as homeowners associations and local governments often prohibit three-tab composition shingles.

Dimensional composition shingles, such as the Certainteed Presidential product line, have become available since the Waterford CC&R was drafted. These are designed to provide 3-dimensional relief and texturing, often as a replacement for shake shingles. They typically are thicker and heavier than three-tab composition shingles, lighter than tile or slate. Waterford is receiving an increasing number of requests to replace shake roofing with dimensional composition, but our CC&Rs prohibit any form of composition roofing.

Many homeowners associations and localities now explicitly permit use of dimensional composition shingles among other roofing materials generally considered to be high-end products. In some cases approval is based on meeting minimum standards for measurable criteria such as weight of a square (covering 100 square feet), thickness, or duration of warranty. A web search for "dimensional composition" roofing showed only citations which explicitly permit its use and none which explicitly prohibit it. Most such citations group dimensional composition products together with materials generally considered to be high quality. Some authorize its use to replace wooden shingles in historic areas with a requirement to preserve the historic appearance of homes dating from periods as long ago as the American Revolution. However, acceptance of dimensional composition materials has been very controversial in one El Dorado Hills village, with many residents insisting that use of any form of composition shingles would harm property values.